


12-31-2012

Integrating Aesthetics within Professional Development for Teachers of English Learners

Audrey Figueroa Murphy

St. John's University, murphy3@stjohns.edu

Follow this and additional works at: https://scholar.stjohns.edu/curriculum_instruction_facpubs

 Part of the [Bilingual, Multilingual, and Multicultural Education Commons](#), [Curriculum and Instruction Commons](#), and the [Teacher Education and Professional Development Commons](#)

Recommended Citation

Murphy, A. F. (2012). Integrating Aesthetics within Professional Development for Teachers of English Learners. *TESOL Journal*, 5(1), 82-104. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.78>

This Article is brought to you for free and open access by the Department of Curriculum and Instruction at St. John's Scholar. It has been accepted for inclusion in Faculty Publications by an authorized administrator of St. John's Scholar. For more information, please contact fazzino1@stjohns.edu.

Integrating aesthetics within professional development for teachers of English learners

Audrey Figueroa Murphy

Cultural diversity has always been one of our nation's greatest strengths. While the school population across the nation continues to diversify by admitting an increasing number of English learners or *ELs* (National Clearinghouse for English Language Acquisition, 2011) the high stakes testing movement maintains its relentless focus on achievement scores and high performance in academic areas. The mandates of *No Child Left Behind* (2002) dictate that all schools must show performance increases in areas such as English language arts and mathematics or suffer dire consequences. Due to this testing, there is a strong emphasis on math, science, and reading, with little time remaining in the school day to teach the arts. As a result, the value of art and aesthetic education within the curriculum has been given less weight and is seen as an adjunct to other subjects (Richmond, 1997). This leads us to consider some disturbing issues. Are our students being short changed and missing out on an opportunity to enrich their creative side, particularly those students who might excel in the arts? Are we hurting our youngsters, especially our English learners, by denying them an opportunity to explore other areas in the curriculum which might motivate them to learn English? Is it possible to include an arts or aesthetic component within the structure of the academic curricular areas? The following article addresses these questions in the form of an action research study focusing upon the integration of aesthetic education into the training protocol for teachers of English learners.

Aesthetic Education: What it is

Aesthetic education is the specific formation of new connections, patterns and perceptions created through the appreciation and reflection of a meaningful experience with the arts (Greene, 2001). Many may not realize that the arts are considered a core academic subject (see Title IX, Part A, Section 9101 (1)(D)(11) under the *No Child Left Behind* Act, 2002). In fact, numerous curriculum areas can incorporate arts and aesthetic education into the day to day classroom activities in effective ways that are aligned to the goals and philosophy of the school. Aesthetic education encompasses

the entire field of art in which lines, colors, forms, and their structures, motions and interrelations are used to create visually, auditorily and/or kinesthetically perceptible works. These include painting, drawing, sculpture, printmaking, pottery, architecture, industrial design, photography, cinematography, textile arts, basketry, typographical arts, multimedia arts, vocal and instrumental music, dance and indigenous forms of visual artistic expression (Spina, 2006, p. 99).

Recently, New York State has adopted the Common Core Standards (see http://www.p12.nysed.gov/ciai/common_core_standards/), a set of internationally benchmarked principles that are aligned to future work and post-secondary education expectations. David Coleman, the architect and co-author of these standards, sees the relevance of art in daily instruction. He believes students should engage in deep studies of works of art, understand art that transcends time, and develop arts literacy, which includes creation of their own art.

The arts reward sustained inquiry and provide a perfect opportunity for students to practice the discipline of close observation whether looking at a painting or lithograph, watching a drama or a dance, or attending to a piece of music. New York State is therefore requesting a sequence of materials that cultivates students' observation abilities in the context of the sustained examination of magnificent works of art that are worthy of prolonged focus. Classroom work would be spent on in depth study; several days or longer might be spent on a specific work. What is requested are a set of arts modules that bring to bear observing, listening to and appreciating expansive works of art across disciplines and grades (Coleman, 2011, p.1).

The Common Core State Standards for English language arts (ELA) specify the rigorous grade-level expectations in the strands of speaking, listening, reading, and writing in order to prepare all students, including English learners, to be college and career ready (New York State Education Department, 2011). English language learners are the fastest growing segment of our school population (Goldenberg, 2008) and as such, they present a particular challenge. How can teachers prepare their English learners to be college and career ready, while learning English within the curricular content?

In order to keep EL students engaged, their work needs to remain motivating and challenging, while supported through the content by assists other than language prompts. Academic language, or the language of the school, is the key to unifying reading, content area activities, and assessment of daily school instruction (Zwiers, 2008). Context clues can be used to support students in the comprehension of unfamiliar words, expressions or concepts so that they are not forced to depend on language alone to make meaning (Cummins, 1981; Eubanks, 2002; Spina, 2006; Zwiers, 2004). As McGuire (1984) states,

an approach using the arts may allow students to form new associations and meanings based upon the creation of innovative experiences. The arts lend themselves to creativity and imagination that promote discussion and further conversations. These practices can become the foundation upon which to build an expanding language base.

The role of arts and aesthetics

An education encompassing the arts may be key to developing the cognitive, linguistic and cultural abilities of ELs (Gardner, 1988), because the study of works of art requires students to engage in levels of scaffolding while actively involving them in the arts experience. While internalizing input (such as sound or mood), which may not be visual, students appear able to engage mental abilities that encourage higher order thought processes (Saxe, 1990). Practices such as writing based on the arts (Grauer, 2005) have substantiated their effectiveness in providing context, background information and visual thinking which go beyond the spoken language.

Andrzejczak, Tranin and Poldberg (2005), in a recent study, suggested that visual arts instruction can build cognitive connections to language and enhance student ability to capture ideas.

Visual arts is more, however, than the creative process. An important element of a visual arts program is the development of skill and aesthetic perception. During this process of looking and replicating the world around, students discover that they see the world in new ways. Often they see colors or shadows they had never noticed before. This heightened perception is an important step in the visual art making process (p.14).

This project capitalized on art creation in the pre-writing process, permitting students additional time for the elaboration of ideas, the construction of descriptive passages, and the development of relevant vocabulary. Students began by observing their world, then created the art, and finally responded to the finished project. Creating the art work before the writing developed a deeper perception of sensitive awareness. The typical sequence in language arts instruction is writing first, followed by an art project based upon the writing. By reversing the order, students were able to engage with their thoughts, feelings and images through art with paint or crayon first, before putting pen or pencil to write on paper, resulting

in a richer play of sensory details. Making art first is especially advantageous for ELs as it allows them to create without being hampered by words they do not know yet know how to use or spell.

Different forms of art can assist ELs in making comprehension more meaningful (Eubanks, 2002). Platt (1977) found that children's drawings can provide a natural way to introduce writing and reading. The use of visual media may assist students in the translation of visual ideas, thereby giving these ideas concrete properties (Anheim, 1990). Johnson (2002) recommends arts based learning as a springboard to promote cultural awareness, understanding, and sensitivity. Sleicher and Reed (2004) suggest that the arts may assist students who have different learning styles in using their bodies to explore language elements. For example, a student who learns kinesthetically will be more likely to retain a word's significance by using drama to portray the word. Drawing the meaning of a word can make it stick in the mind of a child who is a visual learner. Replacing or adding words to a poem might be a novel way for a student, who is a logical or mathematically oriented thinker, to learn how to use new words. In these scenarios, the students are not memorizing new words, but are actively engaged with the language and using it to produce their own work.

Walters (2006) conducted a study to examine whether arts education had a significant impact on the academic achievement of ELs and economically disadvantaged students. The study was divided into three levels of treatment: in one group, students received no art instruction, a second group received art instruction taught by a specialist, and a third group attended classes in which art was integrated into the core curriculum. The findings revealed that ELs who received art within an integrated curriculum achieved higher performance scores than those not receiving art instruction, or students attending classes taught by art specialists.

That same year, a significant study was conducted by Spina (2006) with the purpose of studying curricula based on authentic arts to assist ELs in acquiring English without losing proficiency in their first language. The participants in the project were two groups of fifth grade students; half of which were taught using an arts based curriculum, and the others taught with traditional English as a Second Language methods. Students were assessed using pre and post test measures in order to track their reading

skills in Spanish and English. Findings suggest that the use of an arts based curriculum may be pivotal in developing the cognitive, linguistic and cultural abilities of ELs.

A recent study conducted by Project Zero at the Harvard Graduate School of Education (Seidel, Tishman, Winner & Palmer, 2009) focused on interviews with arts practitioners, and visited exemplary programs in the arts to determine what constituted quality in arts education. An important finding emerging from this research highlighted the students' own experience with the arts as indicators of success, rather than the quality of the artworks produced. This study points to the need for professional development opportunities for educators to develop strategies of observing students learning with the arts, often difficult to see, and to reflect on their own philosophies of practice. This focus is the purpose of the following action research study.

Method

The purpose of action research is the improvement of teachers' own instruction, their understanding of practice and its relation to the environment in which they live (Torbert, 2006). Heron and Reason (2006) state that in action research "the primary procedure to use is inquiry cycles, moving several times between reflection and action" (p. 145). The focus is on inquiry, which is transformative in nature so that participants can learn to change the way they relate to the world by becoming more aware of aesthetic and expressive forms.

This study focused upon work with a teaching artist from The Lincoln Center Institute (LCI) who partners with educators from Pre-K up into the 12th grade. LCI bases its principles on the teachings of Maxine Greene (Lincoln Center Institute, 2005), LCI's philosopher in residence, to cultivate the imagination. Greene believes that it is through literature and the arts that the complete range of human experience can be attained. She views aesthetics as the study and making of art, sees its relation to culture and its perception in the eye of the observer. Greene encourages educators to imagine alternative ways of being, and to stretch their thinking to include ways that things could be or might become. Works of art should be viewed as multi-layered with students noticing new possibilities and stored meanings between what was expressed and what has yet to be discovered.

This action research project used the framework of Maxine Greene's writing to incorporate aesthetics into the training protocol for teachers of ELs. Greene believes that education teaches others to explore concepts about themselves and the world in which they live so that they may embrace ambiguity and question experiences (Shaw & Rozycki, 2007). For this reason we selected a collection of photographs by Mary Whalen called *Household Artifacts* (see www.marywhalen.com/MW_DreamWeaver/marywhalen_biography.html), as the aesthetic guiding point for our mission and vision. Household Artifacts consists of a portfolio of black and white images of family possessions from the past three generations, including such items as a set of pearls, a turn of the century telephone, and a doll. Some of the images show signs of use, others were treasured possessions, and still others show signs of neglect. All photographs were open to interpretation and featured some aspects of ambiguity. The intent was to incorporate these photographs within the working curriculum of English as a second language (ESL) teachers, and inspire them to not only learn to appreciate the medium under study, but to weave a form of the arts into their own class instruction. Consequently our research question evolved into the following: How can aesthetic education, as seen through the photographs of Mary Whalen, enrich teaching practices of language acquisition for English learners?

The Participants

This action research study began in my university teaching class and was carried out to completion in the classrooms of the teacher participants with their EL students. Twenty three public school teachers who were seeking English as a Second Language (ESL) certification participated in the project. All twenty three participants were female; sixteen had masters' degrees, two were international students, and seven were currently registered in the school's Master's Program. Twenty one of the teaching participants were already working in some field within the area of education.

Procedure

The framework for the class visit by the LCI artist into my university classroom was guided by the work of Torbert (2006), along with Heron and Reason's four different ways of knowing through the lens of aesthetics (2006), both seen below in four stages:

Stage	Torbert, 2006	Heron and Reason, 2006
1	Experiential Knowing: Achieved through face to face encounters, using empathy, significance and character as relevant markers.	Visioning: attention to the inquiry, purpose and mission throughout the aesthetic experience.
2	Propositional Knowing: Learning about something by way of ideas, expressed through explanatory declarations.	Strategizing: An area where dreams and passion predominate, and the guiding question is <i>what if?</i>
3	Presentational Knowing: Attained through the use of expressive forms of aesthetics, such as drama, movement, story and dance.	Performance: Combining the aesthetic, sensual and practical aspects into a visual re-enactment
4	Practical Knowing: Understanding how to accomplish something and make it meaningful through an ability or skill.	Assessment: The measurement of the performance and its effects and relation to the outside world.

In preparation for the upcoming visit with the teaching artist, a reading selection, *Art and Imagination* (Greene, 1995), was read by the class at home before the workshop. This piece would set the stage for the teacher participants to think about the descriptive process when viewing a work of art, and to carefully consider what they observe before making a judgment.

On the day of the visit to my university class, the teaching artist from LCI began with the visioning phase, using experiential knowing, by placing the black and white photographs from Mary Whalen's collection around the room. The teacher participants, who were divided into five groups, were asked to select five different photographs based upon specific criteria that would encourage conversation, such as a photograph that

- makes you want to talk about it
- is controversial
- invokes memory
- suggests ambiguity
- promotes conversation about the world of photography

The following five photographs, all black and white laminates, were chosen and given out, one to each group:

- A white winding staircase in a dark house

- A face, half of which was blurred and seemed to be running off the page
- Sparkling white pearls, laid in an oval shape against a black velvet background
- A porcelain mask of a face without eyes, against a black background
- The face of a little girl's doll, broken on one side, white against a dark backdrop.

During the next phase, strategizing or propositional knowing, the participants were asked to describe everything they noticed about their assigned photograph, with the caution that they were to refrain from interpreting what they saw. Next they were to free associate using the image of the photograph they had been given, and create a web of these connections. The groups were encouraged to think of different curricular areas, personal memories, books read, songs heard, and expand from there as far as possible. The members then used their assigned photograph and one of the associations from the created web to write brief narratives, each of which was shared with the other members. Following this, each group chose one member's narrative and together presented it to the whole class as a performance, a dance or song. By doing this, the teacher participants were able to transform what was written on paper to a performance based genre centered upon an idea generated from the photograph. This phase corresponded to the performance component of the framework whereby all aspects of the aesthetics, sensual and practical associations were combined together in a novel creation.

At the end of the class, the teacher participants were animated, energized and buzzing with excitement, ready for the assessment phase. Their study of a work of art that had started with a brainstorming session was transformed into a writing piece and finally culminated in a performance. To transfer their learning and make it relevant to their practices, we then reviewed the article read in preparation for this class, and reflected on one part of the reading that was particularly meaningful. We related the reading selection to the photo each group had studied or to the performance enacted, making connections to our work as teachers of ELs. How would this protocol be followed to make the ESL curriculum come alive for students and ensure progress in the language skills necessary for English proficiency?

Results

While participating in the study, the teachers commented that they found the activities stimulating and worthwhile. Some of the reactions included “I feel that if I had done the word web and writing alone, I would not have had the range of ideas and thought processes that were developed as when I had gone through them in a small group session.” Another wrote “Any time that you bring a form of art into the classroom, it allows for open communication and interaction. The photographs of Mary Whalen are perfect for this activity as they bring out concepts of ambiguity and vagueness-great techniques for building vocabulary for ELs.” A third participant said “I realized that it is not the photograph that carries the meaning, but it is the viewer that makes it come alive. A picture can have many meanings and portray many different stories.” The photographs and resulting activities sparked the participants’ imaginations and enlightened their thinking about art and aesthetic instruction.

When interviewed about integrating these activities into their ESL curriculum, most teacher participants felt it was an excellent way to stimulate conversation, vocabulary building, and encourage students to share stories with each other. One teacher made the connection between group work and EL’s confidence, saying “...going through a thought process as a group will make ELs feel less self conscious about their language skills...” Another said that due to the different backgrounds and cultures from which her students came, each had a different perception of the picture they were viewing. An additional teacher commented “these pictures made me think deeply about integrating art in my work and the photos of Mary Whalen are a perfect segue.” By listening to the participants’ comments, it was apparent that the enthusiasm and energy they experienced would be brought back to their classrooms.

As a culminating activity, the five groups planned thematic units for different language proficiencies and age levels. Since ELs enter the school system with different abilities and backgrounds, the task had to be differentiated to meet the needs of this diverse student population. Each group had a specific ESL lens on which to focus their project and guide the purpose of their instruction: beginning ELs, intermediate ELs, advanced ELs, and SIFE (students with interrupted formal education).

Each team of teacher participants tackled the challenge in a different way. The group assigned to focus upon intermediate ELs wrote lessons in which their students would brainstorm characteristics they saw within their photograph. Following this, the students would develop synonyms to incorporate within their writing. Another group, the teacher participants planning work for advanced ELs, had been given the picture of a mask without eyes. After reflecting on this photograph, they developed a Social Studies unit in which their students would research different ceremonies that used masks. Their students would then reflect on the functions of masks and write about the feelings that might be evoked.

The other groups each focused on the specific characteristics for the areas of need for their EL students. The teacher participants designing material for SIFE students were aware that their lessons must be differentiated due to the varied English proficiency levels of this group of students. They believed that their group's picture of a doll with a broken face might lead to conversations about what to do with broken or unwanted household items, resulting in lessons on recycling for a science unit. Teacher participants preparing for the beginning ELs had been assigned the picture of a face, half of which was unfocused, with the image appearing to spill from the center. By studying the picture, they planned to design a unit on change and transformation. This theme would be carried across the different curriculum areas of science, social studies and math. Those students new to the country or unable to write would be encouraged to draw or write in their native language.

Teachers were contacted a month later to ascertain if they were able to incorporate features of aesthetic education into their daily curriculum for English learners. One of the participants, Maria M., said her class had been learning how to describe character, setting and plot during their language arts class. Her first graders were studying Romare Bearden, an artist who displayed aspects of his life through collages. She showed the class one of Bearden's collages, which portrayed two boys swimming. Together they generated a list of action verbs based on their observations, along with a list of words which coincided with the setting. The students acted out the action words describing some of the concepts they had studied. As a culminating activity, the students thought of one event that happened to them and created a collage. They read each collage as a story, including setting, action and character.

Elena C. asked her students to research different types of art from their culture and bring a printed picture of it to class. Students were asked to brainstorm ideas their pictures brought to mind. Following this, they wrote a paragraph about their feelings based upon these new vocabulary words. Elizabeth F., in her class of beginning ELs, brought postcards of paintings by well-known artists to class. After dividing students in pairs, one child in each pair selected a card (which was not shown to the partner), observed it, and took notes on it for three minutes. This first partner then described the picture to his partner, using as many descriptive words as possible. The second partner attempted to draw the picture by listening carefully, with the first child giving directions. The partners then switched roles, with each describing a painting for the other to draw. After comparing and admiring each other's work, students wrote a detailed description of the scene in the picture, which was reenacted as a performance for groups of classmates.

Other teachers commented on the action reaction project and its relevance to instruction in their classrooms: "Art making in my class has leveled the playing field, especially for my students who are second language learners and finding it challenging to learn English." Another teacher felt that "implementing this in my class has permitted many of my students, who normally do not excel in academics, to show pride in their abilities." Many participants wrote that by using the photos with their classes, they discovered that students can demonstrate their understanding of ideas and concepts in different and non-traditional ways.

Discussion

The following four step protocol (Torbert, 2006; Heron & Reason, 2006) defining action research in this project was carried out in my university class and replicated by teachers in their own classrooms with ELs:

1. Visioning/Experiential Knowing was explored as the teacher participants brainstormed and captured essential thoughts about their photos in the university setting. In their classrooms, students generated action verbs based upon the collages and thought of ideas the pictures brought to mind.
2. Strategizing/Propositional Knowing was seen in the study as the teacher participants described everything they noticed about their photographs, focusing on ambiguity and going as far from the

concrete details as possible. In their classrooms, the teachers replicated this step by asking their students to think about the photos and pictures displayed and come up with words to describe them. Another teacher asked her students to take notes on the picture displayed, which were then used in writing.

3. Performance/Presentational Knowing was enacted in the university setting as the teacher participants wrote narratives based upon their created web and shared it with their group. The teachers also created performances based upon their writing, bringing words to life originally generated from the photos. In their classes, the process was carried out according to each teacher's interpretation of the protocol relevant to their instruction. In one class, a student drew while listening to another student's description, creating shapes and figures based upon words read aloud. In another teacher's class, the students acted out the words they had produced after studying a collage, bringing words to life generated from a picture.

4. Assessment/Practical Knowing was created as the teacher participants designed units for their own classrooms based upon the photos studied and aligned them to their curriculum. Additionally, the teachers reflected upon their experiences, and shared ideas through the design of aesthetic education units (see example in Table 1). The curricular products developed were analyzed using *Danielson's Framework for Teaching*, Domain 1e: Designing coherent instruction (New York State Department of Education, 2011). Emerging themes aligned to the rubric included engagement in high-level cognitive activities, differentiation for proficiency levels, and clear unit structure to address diverse student needs.

These practices are corroborated by research conducted by Latta and Chan (2011) which suggests teachers' practices will be more relevant to ELs through the creation of art first, followed by a language arts activity, as opposed to the customary way of using art after a reading or writing experience. Reading and writing based on the arts serves to build content, visual thinking, and access to prior schema, all essential for ELs to make meaning (Andrzejczak et al., 2005; Grauer, 2005) and consequently, assist in academic performance (Anheim, 1990; Eubanks, 2002; Platt, 1997; Sleicher & Reid, 2004). In this research study, the protocol followed in the university class and reproduced in teachers' own classrooms, was built upon action research based on an aesthetic focus (Heron & Reason, 2006; Latta & Chan, 2011;

Torbert, 2006). But it was students' own exposure to the arts experience as an end to itself (Seidel et al, 2009) that enabled teachers to excite, inspire and challenge ELs to become enthused about their own learning.

The classrooms of the teachers taking part in this project may have been the first educational environment in which their newly arrived students felt comfortable enough to participate fully (Eubanks, 2002). By designing the classroom itself to support dialogue between teachers and students, and between the students themselves, the arts based classroom can provide a level playing field for those who come from different academic and language backgrounds. If the native language of ELs is viewed as an obstacle in traditional education, during instruction for ELs based upon authentic art, language is perceived differently. Integrated arts instruction encourages students to utilize alternate modes of expression, resulting in a growth in their expressive abilities. Consequently, a work of art can become an excellent vehicle to not only develop an appreciation of aesthetics, but to acquire academic language, a basic component of the rich content vocabulary needed for language acquisition and continued growth. As a result of participating in this action research, the teachers reported that they learned how to integrate arts and aesthetics into curricular units for ELs, while continuing to address their linguistic needs to ensure language progress.

Implications for English learners

As seen by the experiences of the teacher participants in this class, teachers of English learners can create aesthetic education units for their EL students based upon a work of art, in this case, a photographic collection by the artist, Mary Whalen. As a result of their encounter with arts and aesthetics, students were able to make new formations, and change their ways of thinking (Greene, 2001). Many forms of aesthetic art can be incorporated into the ESL curriculum to not only allow ELs to engage fully within the curriculum, but to enable all students to see the beauty and relevance of art in everyday life (Spina, 2006). Many states, through the implementation of the Common Core Standards (2011), are moving towards using aesthetic art to help students fine tune the practice of close observation and deep noticings to understand the relevance of art modules in all classes (Coleman, 2011). Be it a photograph, a painting or a performance, skills needed for English acquisition such as vocabulary study and language

focus can be integrated within an aesthetic unit in the content area (Table 1). Teaching through aesthetic units in an integrated arts setting accommodates ELs as they are learning, because comprehension is supported by the context, and is not solely dependent on linguistic clues

As teachers design aesthetic education units for ELs, they can make use of all content areas to integrate the work of art, which can be used as a springboard to teach English skills. Since ELs are in all content classes, subject areas can be used as vehicles to teach language (Murphy, 2009). The same holds true for aesthetic education. Aesthetics can be used to inspire EL students so that they are discovering art, developing their abilities to observe, and learning about content while acquiring English. It is up to educators to challenge students to wonder about the world and spark their curiosity to want to continue their learning journey. By designing aesthetic education units, works of art can be used to evoke inquiry and wonder, and encourage EL students to make meaning of the work under study, thus enabling teachers to motivate them to achieve, and reach their full potential.

References

- Andrzejczak, N., Trainin, G., & Poldberg., M. (2005). From image to text: Using images in the writing process. *International Journal of Education & The Arts*, 6(12), 1-17.
- Arnheim, R. (1990). *Thoughts on art education*. Los Angeles: Getty Center for Education in the Arts.
- Coleman, D. (2011, April). Guiding principles for the arts. In NY State Education Department's presentation *Bringing the Common Core to Life* conducted at the State Education Building in Albany, NY.
- Cummins, J. (1981). The role of primary language development in promoting educational success for language minority students. In California State Department of Education (Ed.), *Schooling and language minority students: A theoretical framework*. p. 3-49. Los Angeles, CA: Evaluation, Dissemination and Assessment Center, California State University, Los Angeles.
- Eubanks, P. (2002). Students who don't speak English: How art specialists adapt curriculum for ESOL students. *Art Education, March*, 2002, 40-45.
- Gardner, H. (1988). Toward more effective arts education. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 22(1), 157-167.
- Goldenberg, C. (2008). "Teaching English language learners: What the research does — and does not — say." *American Educator*, 32(2), 42-53.
- Grauer, K. (2005). Starting with art: Relating childrens' visual and written expression. In K. Grauer & R. L. Irwin (Eds.), *Starting with.....* (p.111-117). Toronto: Canadian Society for Education through Art.
- Greene, M. (1995). Art and imagination: Reclaiming the sense of possibility. *Phi Delta Kappan*, 76(5), 378-382.
- Greene, M. (2001). *Variations on a blue guitar: The Lincoln Center Institute lectures on aesthetic education*. New York: Teachers College Press.
- Greene, M. (2007). Aesthetics as research. Retrieved 12/18/11 from www.maxinegreene.org/articles/php
- Heron, J., & Reason, P. (2006). The practice of co-operative inquiry: Research 'with' rather than 'on' people. In P. Reason & H. Bradbury (Eds.), *Handbook of Action Research*. London, England: Sage Publications, 144-154.
- Johnson, L. (2002). Art-centered approach to diversity education in teaching and learning. *Multicultural Education*, 9(4), 18-21.
- Latta, M. M., & Chan, E. (2011). *Teaching the arts to engage English language learners*. New York: Routledge.
- Lincoln Center Institute (2005). Designing a learning community. Retrieved on 7/1/13 from <http://handbook.laartsed.org/models/index.ashx?md=27>

- McGuire, G. N. (1984). How arts instruction affects reading and language: Theory and research. *Reading Teacher*, 37(9), 835-839.
- Murphy, A. (2009). Tracking the progress of English language learners. *Phi Delta Kappan*. 91(3), 25-31.
- National Clearinghouse for English Language Acquisition (2011). *The growing number of English learner students 2008/2009*. Retrieved on 9/29/11 from http://www.ncele.gwu.edu/files/uploads/9/growingLEP_0809.pdf
- New York State Department of Education (2011). *Danielson's framework for teaching*. Appendix A: The framework for teaching. Retrieved 12/09/11 from http://usny.nysed.gov/rttt/teachersleaders/practic rubrics/Docs/Teachscape_Rubric.pdf
- New York State Education Department (2011). *Application of common core state standards for English language learners*. Retrieved 10/4/11 from http://www.p12.nysed.gov/ciai/common_core_standards/pdfdocs/application-for-english-learners.pdf
- No Child Left Behind Act of 2001, 20 USC 6301 et seq. (2002), Retrieved 10/2/11 from <http://www2.ed.gov/policy/elsec/leg/eseea02/107.html>
- Platt, P. (1977). Grapho-linguistics: Children's drawings in relation to reading and writing skills. *Reading Teacher*, 31(3), 262-268.
- Richmond, S. (Summer, 1998). In praise of practice. A defense of art making in education. *Journal of Aesthetic Education*, 32(2), 11-20.
- Saxe, G. (1990). *Culture and cognitive development: Studies in mathematical understanding*. Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc.
- Seidel, S., Tishman, S., Winner, E., Hetland, L. & Palmer, P. (2009). A study of excellence in arts education. *Principal Leadership*, 10(3), 46-51.
- Shaw, R. P., & Rozycki, E. G. (2000). The educational theory of Maxine Greene. Retrieved 12/19/ 11 from <http://www.newfoundations.com/GALLERY/Greene.html>
- Spina, S. U. (2006). World together... words apart: An assessment of the effectiveness of arts-based curriculum for second language learners. *Journal of Latinos and Education*, 5(2), 99-122.
- Sleichter, K., & Reid, S. (2004). Forty years of teaching and we're still learners: A practical guide to incorporating the arts into the curriculum. In M. Goldberg, (Ed.), *Teaching English language learners through the arts: A suave experience*. Boston, MA: Pearson Education, Inc.
- Torbert, W. (2006). The practice of action inquiry. In P. Reason & H. Bradbury (Eds.), *Handbook of action research*. London, England: Sage Publications, 207-217.
- Walters, M. L. (2006). *Visual and performing arts and the academic achievement of English language learners and students in poverty*. The University of Southern Mississippi, Proquest Dissertations and Theses, retrieved on 10/3/11 from <http://search.proquest.com/docview/304977471?accountid=14068>

- Whalen, Mary (2011). *Mary Whelan Photography*. Retrieved on 10/2/11 from http://www.marywhalen.com/MW_DreamWheaver/marywhalen_biography.html
- Zwiers, J. (2004). The third language of academic English. *Educational Leadership*, 62(4), 60-63.
- Zwiers, J. (2008). *Building academic language: Essential practices for content classrooms*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.